Jörg Haustein

Writing Religious History

The Historiography of Ethiopian Pentecostalism

2011 Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

> ISSN 1611-0080 ISBN 978-3-447-06528-3

Contents

Preface	Х
Abbreviations	ΧV
1 Introduction: Parameters for a History of Ethiopian Pentecostalism	1
for Pentecostalism in Ethiopia	2
1.1.1 Imperial Ethiopia	2
1.1.2 The Ethiopian Revolution	7
1.1.3 The Rise of the EPRDF	9
1.2 Historical Overview: A Synopsis of Pentecostalism in Ethiopia	11
1.2.1 Earlier Protestant Missions	11
1.2.2 Pentecostal Missions	14
1.2.3 The Establishment of Ethiopian Pentecostal Churches	14
1.2.4 After the Ethiopian Revolution	15
1.2.5 The Development in Recent Years	16
1.2.6 The Charismatic Movements	19
1.3 Historical Archive: Sources About Pentecostalism in Ethiopia	22
1.3.1 Imperial Ethiopia	22
1.3.2 After the Ethiopian Revolution	23
1.3.3 During Socialist Dictatorship	26
1.3.4 After the Derg	29
1.4 Historical Narratives: Writing a History of Ethiopian Pentecostalism	33
2 Relating to Missionary Beginnings:	
The Finnish and Swedish Pentecostal Missions in Ethiopia	37
2.1 Defining the Missionary Contribution	37
2.1.1 Highlighting Mission Independence	38
2.1.2 Asserting the Missionary Contribution	41
2.1.3 Claiming the Missions' Legacy for Ethiopian Churches	44
2.1.4 Marginalized Foreign Missions	46
2.2 The Finnish Pentecostal Mission	52
2.2.1 The Establishment of a Free Mission	52
2.2.2 The Scope of Finnish Pentecostal Missions	55
2.3 The Swedish Pentecostal Mission	59
2.3.1 Fragmented Beginnings	61

viii Contents

2.3.2 The Scope of Swedish Pentecostal Missions	66
2.4 A "Kenyan Match": Chacha Omahe	69
2.4.1 Historical Context	70
2.4.2 Representations of Chacha's Visits	73
2.4.3 Projections of Mission Independence	
2.5 Leaving the Finnish Mission	
2.5.1 Identifying the Separation Event	
2.5.2 Determining the Causes of the Split	
	_
3 Discovering Origins: Ethiopian Revival Movements and the Foundation	
of a Pentecostal Church	
3.1 A Genealogy of Revival Stories	
3.1.1 Contemporaneous Missionary Correspondence	
3.1.2 Early Histories	
3.1.3 Full Gospel Believers' Church Histories	
3.1.4 Mennonite Histories	
3.1.5 Finnish Mission and Gennet Church (GC) Histories	
3.2 The Nazaret yäsämay bərhanMovement	
3.2.1 Orthodox and Mennonite Roots	
3.2.2 Finding a Pentecostal Identity	
3.3 The Addis Ababa Student Movement	118
3.3.1 Laying the Foundations	118
3.3.2 Change and Continuity	121
3.4 Forming an Ethiopian Pentecostal Church	125
3.4.1 Securing a National Mandate	125
3.4.2 Becoming a Pentecostal Church	128
3.4.3 Names and Claims	130
3.4.4 Missionaries and the Ordination of Ethiopian Elders	132
4 Defining the Politics of Persecution: Pentecostals in the Ethiopian Empire	137
4.1 Setting the Stage: The Application for Registration	
4.1 Persecution as Evidence of Systematic Injustice	
4.1.1 Persecution as Evidence of Systematic injustice	
4.1.3 Persecution as an Issue for Political Negotiations	
4.2 Identifying the Persecutor	151
4.2.2 The Government Circular	
4.3 Identifying the Persecuted	160
4.3.1 Excluding Heterodox Movements	
4.3.2 Excluding Other Christian groups	
4.3.3 Profiling the Persecuted	
4.4 Managing Persecution Politics	
4.4.1 Audiences and Negotiations	
4.4.2 Defense Strategies	
4.4.3 International Press Relations	
4.4.4 Ecumenical Deliberations	179

Contents ix

5 Accounting for the Underground: Persecution and the Proliferation
of Pentecostalism During the Derg
5.1 Ethiopia's Churches During the Derg
5.1.1 The Ethiopian Orthodox Church
5.1.2 Mainline Protestant Churches
5.1.3 The Full Gospel Believers' Church
5.1.4 The Finnish Mission and the Gennet Church 200
5.1.5 The Swedish Mission and the Hiwot Berhan Church 205
5.1.6 Other Pentecostal Groups
5.2 Pentecostal Accounts of the Derg
5.2.1 Sent by God to Bring Revival
5.2.2 Ethiopian Socialism and Pentecostal Christianity 214
5.2.3 The Legacy of Persecution
5.3 Persecution and the Charismatic Movement
5.3.1 Sharing the Story of Persecution
5.3.2 Who is a "Pente"?
5.3.3 Persecution and Denominational Boundaries
5.3.4 Early Charismatic Origins
5.3.5 Persecution from Within
6 Conclusion: Writing Religious History
6.1 Narrativity: Storyboards of Pentecostal History
6.2 Discourse: Empty Signifiers in Pentecostal Historiography 251
6.3 Genealogy: Descent and Emergence of the Pentecostal Movement 254
6.4 Context: A Never-Ending Story of Pentecostal History
Bibliography
Archives and Collections
List of Informants
Index 286

Preface

I stood and watched as the Pentecostal healing service simply erupted with noise. So far, I had witnessed much singing, testimonies by different people, prayers for healing, violent exorcisms, and a sermon of forty-five minutes. But now, roughly four and a half hours after the meeting had begun, the noise and worship intensity reached an unprecedented level in a simultaneous mass prayer, prompted by the worship leader. As a Western observer, unaccustomed to such long services and tired from sitting on an uncomfortable bench, I had long since grown weary, but not so the people around me. I carefully peeked at my surroundings—a small fraction of the close to 4,000 worshipers that I could observe. A few bowed forward, mumbling prayers in Amharic. Others loudly prayed in tongues, with their heads tilted back and their eyes closed. Still others, as if combating invisible forces, regularly underscored their prayers with a karate-like hand movement and a forcefully uttered "bä iyäsus sim!" A number of worshipers around me quivered and shook violently, some lost their balance and fell back onto their benches. One woman not far from me ecstatically rolled her head in fast motion until she lost consciousness. The leader of the mass prayer fueled this atmosphere by repeatedly shouting "iyäsus geta näw!" and his cry was echoed by many participants. Nobody seemed to be bothered by the intense noise, not even the babies I saw around me, huddled up to their mothers. As I stood there in the Ketena Hulet Full Gospel Church, observing this energy and vibrancy among the worshipers, I realized that Pentecostalism had come to Ethiopia to stay.

In the terminology of the anthropologist Clifford Geertz, this introduction to my fieldwork might qualify as a "Being There" narrative.³ In his astute analysis of anthropological writings, Geertz proposes that "Being There" narratives assert the authorship and the authority of an anthropological work by pointing to the writer's physical presence "there" at a given point in time. They "author-ize" a text by visibly inserting the author into the text in distinction to the researched group, they ground his competence in asserting his physical "Being There," and by nonchalantly oscillating between his visual sensations and thoughtful musings they suggest that anyone who would have "Been There," would have seen and felt the same. My opening followed the same pattern. I am visibly present and yet distinguished from those I observe. There are signs of bodily discomfort to assert my physical participation and to hint at the price I paid for "Being There." Moreover, by quoting Amharic phrases and providing their translation, the reader is assured of my basic linguistic capabilities for understanding what is going on. At the same time, my self-identification as a

^{1 &}quot;In Jesus' name!"

^{2 &}quot;Jesus is Lord!"

³ See CLIFFORD GEERTZ, Works and Lives: The Anthropologist as Author (Standford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1988), 1–24.

Preface xi

somewhat distanced "Western observer" sets up an alliance with readers who would be unfamiliar with the scene, suggesting that they would read the situation in a similar fashion. Finally, the conclusion to my observations, which in its generality can hardly be refuted, assures the imagined audience that a certain reflectiveness is aspired to, which of course is grounded in actually "Being There."

Indeed, I was there. I actually did attend the Saturday healing service at the Ketena Hulet Full Gospel Believers' Church in Addis Ababa on February 21, 2004 from 9:30 a.m. to 1:30 p.m. I sat on those benches, took notes, observed, and thought. However, there are many different forms of representing this past event, all of which shape its content. My observation protocol of that service is a rather dry and phenomenological listing of worship positions, convulsions, sermon arguments, exorcism rites, and testimonies. It also meticulously records the beginning and end times of each service part as well as the number of participants, their clothes, and certain features of the building, perhaps aspiring to some standardization for comparing similar events. My diary entry about the event, on the other hand, is rather short. It reflects the worship noise and intensity with some irony, notes my achievements and difficulties in understanding the Amharic language, and mentions a little encounter with children afterwards, that was omitted in the observation protocol but corresponds well with my diary's interest to reflect the omnipresent poverty. From these two accounts and my vague memories, I have produced a third narrative, my "Being There" account above, authorizing my presence and observations. This account, however, was shaped by a fourth interest, that is, to conform to Clifford Geertz ironic representation of such narratives in order to make a point about the many forms of representing history. Finally, it should be added that the self-transparency and intentionality contained in these prefacing remarks also have an "author" function which I will leave to others to analyze.

This multifariousness of the historic representation is the main topic of my book about Ethiopian Pentecostalism. When I first set out to explore Pentecostal and Charismatic movements in Ethiopia, I quickly realized that they were a vibrant and growing part of Ethiopian Christianity and that there was much primary material available, but almost no comprehensive and academic treatise of its history or theology. Therefore, I began to collect interviews, documents and personal impressions from as many churches as possible, in the rather ambitious hope of writing an overview which would not only detail the genesis and present characteristics of the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements in Ethiopia, but also study how Pentecostal identities are constructed and sustained in the Ethiopian church landscape. However, when I began to scrutinize the history of Ethiopian Pentecostalism, I became intrigued and fascinated by the divergence of my sources, the often irreconcilable differences between two accounts of the same event, the different ways to set up a story, and the political thrust of my informants. This called for a detailed investigation that would move beyond traditional historiography and thereby could account for the many narrative plots, historical arguments and political implications contained in my sources. In the course of writing such a history, I realized that I was in fact studying the production of Ethiopian Pentecostal and Charismatic identities—in their past and present historiographic representations. Thus, by equally considering the historical and the xii Preface

historiographical sides of oral and written histories, it became possible to show how Ethiopian Pentecostalism came into "being" as a concept, over and over again.

The resulting monograph is a slightly revised version of my doctoral dissertation, which was accepted in 2009 by the Faculty of Theology at the University of Heidelberg. Most material for this study was gathered in three field trips to Ethiopia, conducted in 2003 from September 8 to October 7, in 2004 from February 17 to April 3, and in 2005 from January 3 to April 1. The largest part of the research was carried out in Addis Ababa, but in 2005 I also spent about three weeks each in Awasa and Bahir Dar. Addis Ababa is by far the largest and most hybrid city of Ethiopia, and almost all denominations have their headquarters there. Awasa is important for the early history of Ethiopian Pentecostalism and is located in a largely Protestant area. Bahir Dar, on the other hand, lies in the Orthodox north and is important for understanding the proliferation of Pentecostalism in contexts classically dominated by the Ethiopian Orthodox Church. During my fieldwork I visited sixtysix different gatherings in twenty-one different denominations, from Sunday services and healing programs to small groups and prayer meetings. In Addis Ababa, I was able to acquire copies of all seminary theses pertaining to the topic of my research, which were a valuable resource never before explored to this extent. I conducted 115 interviews in Ethiopia, and fiveteen more interviews were arranged in other contexts, partly as telephone conversations with Ethiopian Pentecostal leaders residing abroad. Altogether there were 140 informants from sixty-four different organizational entities.⁴ The typical interview length was roughly one and a half hours, and almost all were recorded on tape and subsequently digitized. Roughly seventy of these interviews, which were most relevant to the history of Ethiopian Pentecostalism, were transcribed and indexed for this study, the others were only revisited on occasion. Since I had guaranteed anonymity to all my informants, the interviews are cited by unique numbers throughout the book.

In addition to the fieldwork in Ethiopia, I conducted a study tour to Finland and Sweden in the summer of 2004 during the course of which I gathered a large amount of archive material from the Finnish and Swedish Pentecostal missions working in Ethiopia. Another visit was paid to the archives of the World Council of Churches in Geneva in November 2007. Relevant excerpts of the Finnish material were translated by Anna-Mari Nikkilä, whom I would like to thank for her diligent and careful work. All other translations of Amharic, Swedish, Norwegian, Danish, and German material were provided by me, unless otherwise indicated. The transliteration of Amharic terms is based on the *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, with the exception of proper names, for which I adhered to the spelling used by the respective persons, and geographic names, which conform to the transliteration on maps by the Ethiopian Mapping Authority. Religious terms are employed as they are used by my informants or in general Pentecostal discourse.

This project would not have been possible without the help and support of many others. First and foremost, I would like to thank my interview partners, who not only

⁴ See List of Informants provided on p. 281.

⁵ See Siegbert Uhlig, ed., Encyclopaedia Aethiopica, vol. 1 (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2003), xx-xxi.

Preface xiii

gave me a significant amount of their time, but also granted me valuable insights into their lives and their faith. I would also like to thank Genet Kebede, Nega Namaga, Solomon Gebremichael and Salam, Daniel Gezahegne, Beyene Dogarso, and Roswitha Schultheiß for providing me with accommodations and logistical assistance. A special thanks also goes out to Paul Baliski and Seleshi Kebede, who facilitated the most important initial contacts for me, and to Bedru Hussein, Debela Birri, and Michael Schultheiß for helping me access the many valuable seminary theses in Addis Ababa. Furthermore, I very much appreciate the support in obtaining archival sources, which was offered by Magnus Wahlström at the Swedish Pentecostal Research Institute in Ekerö, Pauli Runolinna and Rauno Mikkonen at Fida in Helsinki, and Paul Johansson and Joy Niswander of the Elim Bible Institute in Lima, New York. Mukiria Chacha has provided me with invaluable material from his fathers' writings, which so far has not been sighted and gives a unique insight into Chacha Omahe's perception of a central part of Ethiopian Pentecostal history.

I am very grateful for Klaus Koschorke's offer to publish this book in his *Studies* in the *History of Christianity in the Non Western World*, and for the assistance of Barbara Krauß and Reinhard Friedrich at Harrassowitz. I would also like to thank Carol Waite for her careful proofreading of an earlier draft of this manuscript. All mistakes remain my own.

I am deeply indebted to my Doktorvater Michael Bergunder, who not only coaxed me toward the uncharted waters of this project, but also supported me in navigating them with his advice and patience. Without his encouragement and the academic environment for Pentecostal Studies that he created, this project would not have been possible. The co-appraisal of the dissertation manuscript was written by Friederike Nüssel, and her insightful questions were also much appreciated in the preparation of this publication.

Finally and most importantly, I would like to thank my wife Cheri, whose friend-ship and support have meant everything to me in this endeavor and beyond.

Heidelberg, April 2011

Jörg Haustein