

Arik Sadan

A Critical Edition
of the Grammatical Treatise
Taḍkirat jawāmi‘ al-‘adawāt
by Muḥammad b. Aḥmad
b. Maḥmūd

2012

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

ISSN 1860-5117
ISBN 978-3-447-06675-4

Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
Preface	XI
Introduction	1
1 Manuscripts used in preparation of the current edition of <i>Taḍkirat jawāmi' al-'adawāt</i>	1
1.1 The initial encounter with <i>Taḍkirat jawāmi' al-'adawāt</i>	1
1.2 Locating parallel manuscripts	1
1.3 The manuscripts and their salient characteristics	2
1.3.1 Bratislava, Univerzitná Knižnica, TG 15 (ms. A)	2
1.3.2 Istanbul, Belediye Yazmaları, K 141 (ms. B)	3
1.3.3 Ankara, Milli Kütüphane, 06 Hk 1978 (ms. C)	3
1.3.4 Manisa, İl Halk Kütüphanesi, 45 Hk 1630 (ms. D)	4
1.3.5 Qom, Madrasa-yi Fayḍiyya, no. 2006 (ms. E)	5
1.3.6 Leipzig, Universitätsbibliothek, K 232 (ms. F)	6
1.3.7 Istanbul, Süleymaniye-Ayasofya, no. 3824 (ms. G)	7
1.3.8 Izmir, Milli Kütüphane, no. 549 (ms. H)	7
1.3.9 Istanbul, Topkapı Sarayı Müzesi, Hazine 175/16 (ms. I)	8
1.3.10 Jerusalem, Maktabat al-Masjid al-Aqṣā, no. 378 (ms. J)	9
1.3.11 Istanbul, Süleymaniye-Kasidecizade, no. 719 (ms. K)	10
1.3.12 Alexandria, Maktabat al-Jāmi'a, Ja'far Walī/320	11
2 Principles of the edition	11
2.1 Text	11
2.2 Technical apparatus	13
3 References to the work and its author in the bibliographical literature	13
4 Meaning of the work's title	14
5 Structure and contents of <i>Taḍkirat jawāmi' al-'adawāt</i>	15
6 Analysis of the subjects which the work deals with	15
6.1 The list of chapters as they appear in ms. D (detailed in §1.3.4) ...	17
6.2 The words introducing the beginning of chapters in the manuscripts and a possible division of the work into three sections	19
The Edition	20
Appendix	125
Bibliography	137

Primary Sources.....	137
Secondary Sources	138
Indices.....	141
Technical Terms	141
Qur'ānic Verses	146

Acknowledgements

This scholarly edition of *Taḍkirat jawāmi‘ al-‘adawāt* written by Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Maḥmūd is the result of a research project which began in 2008, when I found the first copy of this work in the University library in Leipzig, Germany. I devoted two years of postdoctoral research in Paris, France and Jena, Germany to complete this edition. My research in France and Germany was supported by the French embassy in Israel and a very generous scholarship from the Minerva Foundation (part of the Max-Planck-Society), respectively.

This work could not have been accomplished without the assistance of friends and colleagues worldwide, whom I would like to mention here.

First and foremost I wish to thank the two researchers who have kindly agreed to accept me as a postdoctoral fellow under their supervision: (1) Prof. Dr. Jean-Patrick Guillaume from the Department of Oriental Studies, Université de la Sorbonne Nouvelle (Paris 3) and the Laboratoire d’Histoire des Théories Linguistiques (CNRS-UMR 7597), under whose supervision I worked during the academic year 2009–2010; (2) Prof. Dr. Tilman Seidensticker from the Institute for Languages and Cultures of the Near East, Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena, under whose supervision I worked during the academic year 2010–2011. Prof. Guillaume answered my questions patiently and did his best to provide me with good working conditions in Paris. Prof. Seidensticker’s unfailing support was a source of great encouragement. Not only did he make all possible resources available for my research, but he also remained constantly involved in the study and interested in its success. This book could not have come to fruition without their continual support and assistance.

During my stay in Paris I was fortunate to receive aid and guidance from several people. Dr. Sylvie Archaimbault, the director of the Laboratoire d’Histoire des Théories Linguistiques, warmly welcomed me and was kind enough to give me a working place there. Dr. Archaimbault also agreed to finance the acquisition of some copies of manuscripts which I needed for my study, from the laboratory’s research budget. Mrs. Anne Cathelineau, head of the library of the Department of Oriental Studies, Université de la Sorbonne Nouvelle (Paris 3), constantly assisted me in my searches in manuscript catalogues and corresponded with the library in Bratislava with respect to the acquisition of a copy of a manuscript located there. Finally, I would like to thank two employees in the Laboratoire d’Histoire des Théories Linguistiques, in whose office I was able to work and who continually helped me with questions and difficulties; these are Mrs. Sophie Lemaire-Hénon, head of communications and seminars, and Mrs. Nita Jacquin, head of administration.

During my stay in Jena I was very lucky to be able to work in the excellent library of the *KOHD*¹ project, where I was able to consult hundreds of manuscript catalogues. Special thanks are due to my colleagues at the *KOHD* project, Dr. Rosemarie Quiring-Zoche and Dr. Florian Sobieroj, who not only warmly welcomed me in their office, but also helped me cope with various professional doubts and difficulties. I would also like to thank Dr. Aḥmad Fāḍil, my colleague in the Institute for Languages and Cultures of the Near East, for assisting me in several difficult points in the edition.

My deepest thanks are also due to Prof. Etan Kohlberg, my teacher from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Prof. Kohlberg first introduced me to the study of manuscripts. He also gave me valuable advice from the beginning of the project till its completion. He has served me as a role model for patience, accuracy and pedantic scientific work, which can be all attested in his outstanding edition of *Kitāb al-qirā'āt* by Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Sayyārī.²

To conclude I would like to thank the following colleagues who assisted me with my continual attempts to obtain copies of manuscripts for my study: Mr. Muḥammad Hāmīd, Dr. Astrid Menz and Prof. Dr. Sabine Schmidtke. Without their help and patience, the current edition would have had a significantly weaker basis. I am, of course, indebted to all the libraries which have agreed to supply me with copies of manuscripts (for details see the introduction).

- 1 These are the initials of the project's name in German, *Katalogisierung der Orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland*, whose English translation is *Cataloging of Oriental Manuscripts in Germany*.
- 2 See Kohlberg, Etan and Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi (eds.), *Revelation and falsification: The Kitāb al-qirā'āt of Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Sayyārī: Critical edition with an introduction and notes by Etan Kohlberg and Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi*. Texts and studies on the Qur'ān IV. Leiden-Boston: E. J. Brill, 2009.

Preface

Taḍkirat jawāmi‘ al-‘adawāt by Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Maḥmūd, whose scholarly edition is the focus of this book, is largely devoted to a discussion of the syntactic and semantic roles of various particles in Arabic. It thus belongs to the genre known as *‘ilm al-‘adawāt* ‘the science of grammatical instruments,¹ or particles’. In his immense *Kaṣf al-zunūn*, Ḥājjī Xalīfa enumerates this genre among the various sciences: *‘ilmu ma‘ānī l-‘adawāti llatī yaḥtāju ‘ilayhā l-mufassiru* ‘the science of the meanings of particles which the commentator needs’.² He further mentions a work entitled *Kitāb al-‘adawāt* by Abū ‘Abdallāh Muḥammad b. ‘Alī b. Ḥumayda l-Naḥwī (died 550/1155).³ The modern author al-Qunnūjī explains Ḥājjī Xalīfa’s short definition as follows:⁴ *wal-murādu bil-‘adawāti l-ḥurūfu wamā šākalahā mina l-‘asmā’i wal-‘af‘ālī wal-zurūfi waqad šannaḥa fihā jamā‘atun kal-Harawī fi l-‘azhiya wabni Umm Qāsim fi l-janā l-dānī wa‘adrajahu l-Suyūṭī fi l-‘itqānī* ‘the intention in [the term] *‘adawāt* is the particles and the nouns, verbs and adverbial accusatives of time and place which are similar to them (i.e. to the particles). On them (i.e. the *‘adawāt*) a group of people wrote [several treatises], such as al-Harawī in [his] *al-‘Azhiya* [fi *‘ilm al-ḥurūf*] and Ibn Umm Qāsim in [his] *al-Janā l-dānī* [fi *ḥurūf al-ma‘ānī*]. Al-Suyūṭī inserted them in his *al-‘Itqān* [fi *‘ulūm al-Qur‘ān*].⁵

Indeed, *‘ilm al-‘adawāt* (or *‘ilm al-ḥurūf*) is known from the early history of Arabic grammar, in the form of various works on particles, some dealing with many and others focusing on only a few.⁶ *‘ilm al-‘adawāt* also has a representation in modern research. Below is a short chronologically ordered survey of milestones

1 This translation is according to Fleisch’s definition of *Ḥarf* in *El*² III, 205a. According to Blachère (ibid. I, 345b, s.v. *Āla*, *Ṣi*), the term *‘adāt* (pl. *‘adawāt*), like *‘āla* (pl. *‘ālāt*), does not seem to have been used by the Arab grammarians of the third/ninth century. Towards the end of the fourth/tenth century the term *ḥarf* ‘particle’ may be regarded as signifying also the grammatical ‘instruments’ later called *‘adāt* and *‘āla*. He adds that this usage seems to imply a distinction between ‘casual action’ (connected with *ḥarf*) and ‘syntactic function’ (represented by *‘adāt* and *‘āla*). For a short survey on the role of *‘adawāt* in the Qur‘ān, see *EALL* IV, 21ff., s.v. Qur‘ān, §2.3.3.

2 See Ḥājjī Xalīfa, *Kaṣf* I, 16 = Ḥājjī Xalīfa, *Kaṣf (Flügel)* I, 39, 5.

3 See Ḥājjī Xalīfa, *Kaṣf* II, 1388 = Ḥājjī Xalīfa, *Kaṣf (Flügel)* V, 37, 2–3 (number 9798).

4 See al-Qunnūjī, *‘Abjad* II, 509.

5 See al-Harawī, *‘Azhiya*; al-Murādī, *Janā*; al-Suyūṭī, *‘Itqān*. These treatises are also discussed below.

6 As the editor of al-Irbilī’s *Jawāhir* notes (al-Irbilī, *Jawāhir*, 5–6), the *ḥurūf* are also discussed in the general grammars, such as Sībawayhi’s *Kitāb*, al-Mubarrad’s *Muqtaḍab* and al-Zamaxšarī’s *Mufaṣṣal*.

of this genre in Arabic grammar, which are accessible to us.⁷ These are followed by some examples of modern studies.

Works until the third century AH:

One of the earliest treatises on particles is *Risāla fī l-ḥurūf al-‘arabiyya* by al-Naḍr b. Šumayl (died AH 203 or 204).⁸ This work is devoted to an explanation of the roles and usages of Arabic letters, some of which function as particles.

Works from the fourth and fifth centuries AH:

Al-Zajjājī (died between AH 337–340)⁹ compiled several grammars, two of which belong to the genre of Arabic particles literature. His *Ḥurūf al-ma‘ānī* discusses various particles and his *Lāmāt* is a treatise on particles containing a *lām*.

Al-Rummānī (died AH 384)¹⁰ also wrote two treatises on particles: (1) *Ma‘ānī l-ḥurūf*, devoted to grammatical explanations of particles and perhaps built on the model of Aristotle’s similar work on particles;¹¹ (2) *Manāzil al-ḥurūf*, a concise grammatical treatise that constitutes, with some slight variation, the final 23 ‘*abwāb* of his above-mentioned *Ma‘ānī l-ḥurūf*.

Al-Harawī (exact year of death unknown, probably in the fifth century AH)¹² composed an important work named *al-‘Azhiya fī ‘ilm al-ḥurūf*, in which he discusses the syntactic and semantic roles of various particles in Arabic.

Works from the seventh century AH onwards:

Al-Irbilī (died AH 631 or later)¹³ wrote *Jawāhir al-‘adab fī ma‘rifat kalām al-‘arab*, in which he thoroughly discusses various particles in Arabic.

7 For other surveys see the editors’ prefaces in al-Murādī, *Janā*, 3–6; al-Mazanī, *Ḥurūf*, 11–16.

8 Full name: al-Naḍr b. Šumayl b. Xaraša l-Māzinī Abū l-Ḥasan. Born in Marw al-Rūd, 122/740, died 203/818, or one year later. Among his teachers was al-Xalīl, Sībawayhi’s main teacher. See *EI*² VII, 873, s.v. al-Naḍr b. Šumayl. See also al-Naḍr b. Šumayl, *Risāla*, 159–160; Ibn al-Nadīm, *Fihrist*, 77.

9 Full name: al-Zajjājī, Abū l-Qāsim ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. Iṣḥāq. Born in Nihāwand in western Persia, ca. 245–257/860–870, died (probably) in Ṭabariyya (Tiberias), either 337/948 or 339–340/949–950. His main teacher was al-Zajjāj (a famous grammarian and Qur’ān commentator, died 311/923), from whom he received his *nisba* because of his long association with him. See *EI*² XI, 378–379, s.v. al-Zajjājī.

10 Full name: al-Rummānī, Abū l-Ḥasan ‘Alī b. ‘Īsā b. ‘Alī b. ‘Abdallāh. Born 296/909, died 384/994. See *EI*² VIII, 614–615, s.v. al-Rummānī.

11 See al-Rummānī, *Ma‘ānī*, 27, 2–7, where the editor quotes Ibn al-Nadīm’s *Fihrist* reference to the structure of Aristotle’s work (see Ibn al-Nadīm, *Fihrist*, 352). On the contents and structure of al-Rummānī’s *Ma‘ānī* see al-Rummānī, *Ma‘ānī*, 27–30.

12 Full name: al-Harawī, ‘Alī b. Muḥammad Abū l-Ḥasan. According to the editor of al-Harawī’s *‘Azhiya* (al-Harawī, *‘Azhiya*, 6–10) he lived before 370/980–981 and died most probably in the fifth century AH. Ḥājjī Khalīfa and Brockelmann do not mention when he died; according to Sezgin his year of death is ca. 410/1019. See Ḥājjī Khalīfa, *Kaṣf* I, 73; 822; Brockelmann, *GAL* II, 919, §43; Sezgin, *GAS* IX, 69, §4.

13 Full name: al-Irbilī, ‘Alā’ al-Dīn b. ‘Alī Ibn al-Imām Badr al-Dīn b. Muḥammad. Born 572/1176, died 631/1234 (or later). See al-Irbilī, *Jawāhir*, 11ff.

Al-Mālaqī (died AH 702)¹⁴ devoted his famous *Raṣf al-mabānī fī šarḥ ḥurūf al-ma‘ānī* to a detailed and systematic analysis of ninety-five Arabic particles.¹⁵

Al-Murādī (died AH 749)¹⁶ produced the well-known *al-Janā l-dānī fī ḥurūf al-ma‘ānī*, which is most probably the basis of Ibn Hišām’s famous *Muğnī l-labīb* (see below).¹⁷

Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya (died AH 751)¹⁸ was a Ḥanbalī theologian and also the author of some grammars, one of which is *Ma‘ānī l-‘adawāt wal-ḥurūf* where he treats the particles in Arabic.

Ibn Hišām (died AH 761)¹⁹ was the author of what is probably the most famous treatise in the genre of *ḥurūf* literature: *Muğnī l-labīb ‘an kutub al-‘a‘arīb*. In this work he explains the Arabic particles at length and divides their usages according to syntactic and semantic criteria.

Al-Suyūṭī (died AH 911)²⁰ was one of the famous and most productive authors in a number of fields. Among his numerous works we find *al-‘Itqān fī ‘ulūm al-Qur‘ān*, a work on Qur‘ānic exegesis in which he also details and analyzes the particles used in the Qur‘ān.

Modern researchers also discuss various aspects of the ‘adawāt and *ḥurūf* in Arabic. Like Arab grammarians, some treat various particles, whereas others concentrate on a single particle. The latter studies are more common than the former. Here are two examples of studies devoted to Arabic particles in general: al-Hilālī’s *al-Ḥurūf al-‘āmila fī l-Qur‘ān al-karīm bayn al-naḥwiyyīn wal-balāğiyyīn* (al-Hilālī, *Ḥurūf*), which analyzes the roles and positions of Arabic particles in the Qur‘ān; Ya‘qūb’s *Mawsū‘at al-ḥurūf fī l-luġa l-‘arabiyya* (Ya‘qūb, *Ḥurūf*), which aims at defining and characterizing all Arabic particles. Examples of studies concentrating on one particle are the following: Aartun’s “Arabisch Lan”, which investigates the particle *lan* ‘not’ (Aartun, *Lan*); Baalbaki’s “Bāb al-fā’ [fā’ + subjunctive] in Arabic grammatical sources” (Baalbaki, *Fā’*), which examines early grammarians’

14 Full name: al-Mālaqī, Abū Ja‘far Aḥmad b. ‘Abd al-Nūr b. Aḥmad b. Rāšid. Born in Malaga, 630/1232–1233, died 702/1302–1303. See al-Mālaqī, *Raṣf*, (⤵)ff.; Ḥājjī Xalīfa, *Kaṣf* I, 908.

15 On the structure of the book see al-Mālaqī, *Raṣf*, 1ff. and especially 4.

16 Full name: al-Murādī, Ibn Umm Qāsim, Badr al-Dīn al-Ḥasan b. Qāsim b. ‘Abdallāh b. ‘Alī. Died 749/1348. Among his teachers was the famous grammarian Abū Ḥayyān, the most distinguished Arab grammarian of the first half of the 14th century AD (died 745/1344). See al-Murādī, *Janā*, 6ff.

17 See al-Murādī, *Janā*, 5–6.

18 Full name: Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya, Šams al-Dīn Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. Abī Bakr al-Zarī. Born in Damascus, 691/1292, died there 751/1350. See *EF* III, 821–822, s.v. Ibn Qayyim al-Djawziyya; Ibn Qayyim, *Iršād* I, 11.

19 Full name: Ibn Hišām, Jamāl al-Dīn Abū Muḥammad ‘Abdallāh b. Yūsuf b. Aḥmad b. ‘Abdallāh. Born in Cairo, 708/1310, died 761/1360. See *EF* III, 801–802, s.v. Ibn Hishām.

20 Full name: al-Suyūṭī, Abū l-Faḍl ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. Abī Bakr b. Muḥammad Jalāl al-Dīn al-Xuḍayrī. Born in Cairo, 849/1445, died in Rawḍa, 911/1505. See *EF* IX, 913–916, s.v. al-Suyūṭī.

discussions of the conjunctive particle *fā*- ‘and then, as a result’ followed by the subjunctive mood; Ullmann’s *Arabisch ‘asā* “vielleicht”: *Syntax und Wortart* (Ullmann, ‘*Asā*), which treats the particle ‘*asā* ‘perhaps’; Wild’s “Die Konjunktion *ḥattā* mit dem Indikativ Imperfekt im klassischen Arabisch” (Wild, *Ḥattā*), which aims at studying the contexts in which the particle *ḥattā* ‘until, so that’ is followed by the indicative mood.

This preface is followed by an introduction and a scholarly edition of *Taḍkirat jawāmi‘ al-‘adawāt*. The introduction details the manuscripts used in preparing the edition and describes this work’s salient characteristics. A perusal of its contents shows that it indeed focuses on the syntactic and semantic positions of particles, but also addresses a number of syntactic, semantic, morphological, phonological and rhetorical issues, not directly related to particles.