Grover Hudson

Northeast African Semitic: Lexical Comparisons and Analysis

2013
Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden
CONTENTS

Preface ....................................................................................................................................... ix

1 BACKGROUND ....................................................................................................................... 1

1.1 Semitic languages of northeast Africa ............................................................................. 1
1.2 Plan of the book ................................................................................................................. 1
1.3 ESe diversity ....................................................................................................................... 2
1.4 Language and dialect ......................................................................................................... 6
1.5 30 varieties of ESe speech ................................................................................................. 7
  1.5.1 Tigre ............................................................................................................................. 9
  1.5.2 Dahalik .......................................................................................................................... 9
  1.5.3 Tigrinya ....................................................................................................................... 10
  1.5.4 Ge’ez ............................................................................................................................ 10
  1.5.5 Gafat ............................................................................................................................ 10
  1.5.6 Soddo ......................................................................................................................... 11
  1.5.7 Dobbi ........................................................................................................................... 11
  1.5.8 Gogot ......................................................................................................................... 11
  1.5.9 Galila ............................................................................................................................ 12
  1.5.10 Mesqan ..................................................................................................................... 12
  1.5.11 Urib ........................................................................................................................... 13
  1.5.12 Muher ......................................................................................................................... 13
  1.5.13 Ezha ........................................................................................................................... 13
  1.5.14 Chaha ........................................................................................................................ 13
  1.5.15 Gura ........................................................................................................................... 14
  1.5.16 Gumer ....................................................................................................................... 14
  1.5.17 Inor ............................................................................................................................. 14
  1.5.18 Meger ........................................................................................................................ 15
  1.5.19 Ener ............................................................................................................................ 15
  1.5.20 Gyeta ......................................................................................................................... 15
  1.5.21 Indeganya .................................................................................................................. 16
  1.5.22 Mesmes ...................................................................................................................... 16
  1.5.23 Inneqor ...................................................................................................................... 16
  1.5.24 Ulbareg ....................................................................................................................... 16
  1.5.25 Silt’e ........................................................................................................................... 17
  1.5.26 Welene ....................................................................................................................... 17
  1.5.27 Zay .............................................................................................................................. 18
  1.5.28 Harari ........................................................................................................................ 18
  1.5.29 Argobba ..................................................................................................................... 18
  1.5.30 Amharic ..................................................................................................................... 19
  1.5.31 Other Semitic speech of northeast Africa ................................................................. 20
## Contents

1.6 Gurage ................................................................................................................... 20
  1.6.1 Gurage membership ................................................................................... 20
  1.6.2 *Sebat Bet Gurage* ................................................................................... 21
  1.6.3 M. Cohen’s Gurage ................................................................................... 22
  1.6.4 Leslau’s Gurage ......................................................................................... 24
  1.6.5 Hetzron’s Gurage ....................................................................................... 27
1.7 Mutual intelligibility testing .................................................................................. 27
  1.7.1 Highland East Cushitic ............................................................................... 27
  1.7.2 ESe: E.-A. Gutt 1980 .................................................................................. 28
  1.7.3 ESe: C. Ahland 2003 .................................................................................. 29
1.8 Lexicostatistics: Bender 1971 ............................................................................ 30
1.9 Fifteen ESe languages ........................................................................................... 34
1.10 Language classification and subclassification ....................................................... 36
  1.10.1 Language families ...................................................................................... 36
  1.10.2 Semitic ........................................................................................................ 37
  1.10.3 ESe ............................................................................................................. 38
  1.10.4 Evidence for subclassification .................................................................... 43
    1.10.4.1 Innovations .......................................................................................... 43
    1.10.4.2 Sound change ........................................................................................ 43
    1.10.4.3 Grammatical morphology: Hetzron 1972 .............................................. 44
    1.10.4.4 Lexicostatistics ..................................................................................... 47
    1.10.4.4.1 Lexicostatistics and tree diagrams ..................................................... 47
    1.10.4.4.2 D. Cohen 1961 ...................................................................................... 48
    1.10.4.4.3 Fleming 1968 ...................................................................................... 49
    1.10.4.4.4 Bender 1971 ....................................................................................... 50
  1.10.5 Lexicostatistic margin of error ................................................................... 53
2 Lexical Comparisons ................................................................................................ 57
  2.1 250 comparisons ............................................................................................... 57
  2.2 The wordlist ....................................................................................................... 58
  2.3 Explanatory notes on the comparisons ............................................................... 61
    2.3.1 Gaps in the data .......................................................................................... 61
    2.3.2 Phonetic writing .......................................................................................... 62
    2.3.3 Dictionary of words of the comparisons ..................................................... 63
    2.3.4 Variant forms .............................................................................................. 63
    2.3.5 Judgement of cognates ............................................................................... 63
    2.3.6 Proto-language reconstructions .................................................................. 63
    2.3.7 Synonyms ................................................................................................... 64
    2.3.8 Borrowings ................................................................................................. 65
  2.4 Three hypotheses of the research ....................................................................... 67
  2.5 Sources for comparisons ................................................................................... 68
  2.6 Tables of comparison ......................................................................................... 69
3 DICTIONARY .......................................................................................................................... 105
  3.1 Explanatory notes on dictionary entries ................................................................. 105
  3.2 Abbreviations used in dictionary entries .............................................................. 107
  3.3 ESe words of the Tables of Comparison ............................................................... 108
  3.4 Indexes to the dictionary ......................................................................................... 237
    3.4.1 Seven lists ........................................................................................................... 237
    3.4.2 Proto-Semitic cognates ..................................................................................... 237
    3.4.3 Proto-Agaw cognates ....................................................................................... 245
    3.4.4 Proto-East Cushitic cognates .......................................................................... 247
    3.4.5 Proto-ESe lexical reconstructions .................................................................... 251
    3.4.6 Cognate sets and sets unique to ESe subgroups ......................................... 254
    3.4.7 Cognates shared by ESe and proto-languages ............................................. 272
    3.4.8 ESe words having Agaw cognates ................................................................ 274

4 FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS .................................................................................................. 279
  4.1 Overview .................................................................................................................... 279
  4.2 Numbers of shared cognates in the 250-word list .............................................. 279
  4.3 Roots unique to ESe and ESe subgroups ............................................................. 284
  4.4 Proto-ESe lexical innovations ............................................................................... 289
  4.5 ESe-Agaw cognates ................................................................................................. 290
  4.6 Proto-language cognates ....................................................................................... 291
    4.6.1 Borrowing or inheritance? .............................................................................. 291
    4.6.2 Proto-Semitic cognates .................................................................................... 292
    4.6.3 Proto-Agaw cognates ..................................................................................... 294
    4.6.4 Proto-East Cushitic cognates ....................................................................... 295
    4.6.5 Estimating ESe-Afroasiatic inheritance ......................................................... 296

5 REFERENCES ...................................................................................................................... 299

Index ............................................................................................................................................ 315

M A P S, T A B L E S, & T R E E D I A G R A M S

Map 1 Approximate centers of territory of 15 ESe languages ................................. 8
Map 2 ‘Éléments de population de la région gouragué’ (Cohen 1931) ....................... 23
Map 3 ‘Gurage and the neighboring languages’ (Leslau 1979) ............................... 25
Map 4 ‘Gurage speech varieties’ (M. Ahland 2010) ................................................. 26

Table 1 Independent pronouns of 5 varieties each of Modern Aramaic and Modern ESe ................................................................. 3
Table 2 Independent pronouns of 5 varieties of Modern Arabic ............................... 4
Table 3 Percent cognates shared by 6 Semitic languages in a 100-word list .......... 5
Table 4 Number of cognates shared by 5 Semitic languages in 71 septuplets of Luke 7, 1-19 ............................................................... 6
Table 5 Six Versions of Sehat Bet Gurage .................................................................. 21
Table 6 Mutual intelligibility scores among 8 ESe speech varieties .......... 28
Table 7 Mutual intelligibility scores among ‘Gurage’ varieties ................... 30
Table 8 Percent cognates shared by 15 ESe varieties in a 98-word list ............. 32
Table 9 Root and pattern morphology in 4 Semitic languages ....................... 37
Table 10 Subject affixes of the nonpast & past in 6 Semitic languages .......... 37
Table 11 A and B-type verbs in 3 ESe languages ......................................... 40
Table 12 Singular independent pronouns of 15 ESe Languages ....................... 41
Table 13 Main verb suffixes in Gogot, Muher, and Arabic ............................ 46
Table 14 Percent cognates shared by 8 ESe languages in a basic wordlist ........ 49
Table 15 Percent cognates shared by 3 ESe languages in a basic wordlist ........ 50
Table 16 Percent shared cognates of 15 ESe varieties in a basic wordlist .......... 51
Table 17 Comparison of percent cognates in Cohen 1961 & Bender 1971 ......... 53
Table 18 Comparison of percent cognates in Bender 1966, 1968, & 1971 ............ 54
Table 19 Number of cognates shared by 14 ESe languages; 250-word list ........ 279
Table 20 Percent cognates shared by 13 ESe languages; 98-word list ............... 280
Table 21 Number of cognates shared by ESe languages and 3 proto-languages .... 291
Table 22 Number of ESe cognates shared by 2 proto-languages ................. 296

Tree Diagram 1 Hetzron’s ESe ................................................................. 45
Tree Diagram 2 Language family A and its subgroups .................................. 47
Tree Diagram 3 Hetzron’s ESe with percent cognates shared by pairs of languages (98-word list) ................................................................. 55
Tree Diagram 4 Hetzron’s ESe with number of cognates shared by pairs of languages (250-word list with synonyms) ....................................... 282
Tree Diagram 5 Revised ESe family tree with number of cognates shared by pairs of languages ..................................................................... 283
Tree Diagram 6 Revised ESe family tree with number of cognates unique to groups .... 285
Tree Diagram 7 Revised ESe family tree with 5 subgroups ......................... 289
The first inspiration of this book was a question I have often heard: ‘How many languages are there in Ethiopia?’ Linguists are fond of answering such questions with a sigh, saying something like ‘Well, it’s hard to say’, when the better answer, certainly as more satisfactory to the questioner, would be ‘Probably about X’ where X is a number reasonably derived from research.

People want linguists to tell them something about what they consider a reasonable measure of human diversity: number of languages. Linguists, however, often seem to prefer to minimize the significance and even good sense of this question, and, indeed, it concerns a complicated and difficult matter. But we shouldn’t think the complications are as interesting or helpful to the questioner as would be (at least at the outset) a simple answer, if an estimate. So this book begins by offering a review of research which can answer the question for Semitic languages of northeast Africa, and goes on to present and interpret lexical evidence about these languages and language-group relations.

The geography of linguistic diversity can be critical evidence in the reconstruction of human prehistory, so the willingness of linguists to examine the question of number of languages, in northeast Africa and elsewhere, is important for our ability to understand present-day issues which have their origin in prehistory. It seems reasonable to suppose that northeast Africa, as the region of contact between Africa and the East, and Europe, has particular modern relevance for linguistic prehistory.

This is not the place to argue about what is the best evidence for linguistic sub-grouping: whether this is shared innovations in the sound system, grammar, or lexicon; of course the evidence of this book must be seen as support for the third of these. Only lexical comparisons can be readily quantified, and as such provide unambiguous evidence for not just difference between languages but degree of difference, as an objective and comparative measure of the extent of linguistic diversity.

Compared to the evidence of sound change, which is usually fraught with difficult-to-recognize exceptions, and compared to the evidence of grammatical change (for example of Hetzron 1972), the significance of which as indicative of critically innovative change is usually controversial, the lexical evidence for sub grouping is at least usually better understood and more readily subject to checking and evaluation. Importantly also, the lexical evidence contributes not just hypotheses for sub grouping, but quantified hypotheses significant for degrees of relationship in sub grouping. The lexicon (more specifically the lexical as opposed to the grammatical morphology) concerns words and morphemes relatively numerous in relation to points of comparison in the sound system and grammar, which, problematically, are subject to the analogical and systemic pressures of paradigms. The lexicon is unquestionably the domain of language in which change is so possible and so frequent that the innovative changes critical for sub grouping have a good degree of likelihood.

Of course one has to be selective in accessing the lexical data: the raw comparisons and previously offered etymologies, which are already vast and always under revision. I hope my selections will be thought reasonable if not entirely sufficient. One has to weigh the extent of data-coverage against available time, and available time can only be very subjectively known. And, critically, one has to avoid too much imagination when deciding
whether to count words as cognate. Moreover, the raw lexical evidence, cognate comparison sets when these are numerous and detailed enough to enable sorting into the many environments relevant for sound change, is simultaneously evidence for the study of sound change, research which so far is insufficiently carried out in these languages. The tables of comparison below (§2.6) and additional comparisons presented in dictionary entries (§3.3) present several hundred such cognate comparison sets.

I want to call attention to the great contribution in the present work of the dictionaries of my teacher Wolf Leslau, especially his Etymological Dictionary of Gurage (1979) and Comparative Dictionary of Ge’ez (1987) (for full bibliographical information see §5). I once proposed the present project to Professor Leslau as a work of co-authorship, but unfortunately it didn’t progress quickly enough on my part to have the benefit of his participation (had he been willing, indeed). The present work would surely have greatly benefitted, too, from consultation with two friends and colleagues whose foundational contributions must also be frequently apparent below, Robert Hetzron and Lionel Bender. I have deeply felt the absence of opportunity for their advice and criticism.

Very fortunately the publisher of this book is Professor Leslau’s longtime publisher, Harrassowitz Verlag, with their unequaled skill and great experience in presenting Semitic linguistic scholarship. I owe thanks also to series editors Werner Diem and Lutz Edzard for accepting this book and waiting patiently, for several years, for it to be finished. I call to the attention of others what all Ethiopians must know by now, that works like the present would be much more difficult and much less complete without the profound and thorough resource which is the Encyclopaedia Aethiopica, also from Harrassowitz. We are in great debt to Professor Siegbert Uhlig and his team for realizing that ambitious and invaluable project.

As expression of thanks for the help I have had from other colleagues too many to name, perhaps it suffices to mention the organizer-hosts of two series of academic meetings the scholarly constancy and value of which have seemed to me critical to promoting and advancing knowledge of Afroasiatic linguistics: the North American Conference on Afroasiatic Linguistics (NACAL), and the Italian Meetings of Hamito-Semitic / Afroasiatic Linguistics. It is easy to overlook the importance of these meetings for the professional contacts, intellectual stimulus, and broad sense of the field which they make possible.


Grover Hudson
East Lansing, Michigan, July 2013