ABHANDLUNGEN FÜR DIE KUNDE
DES MORGENLANDES

Im Auftrag der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft
herausgegeben von Florian C. Reiter

Band 101

Board of Advisers:

Christian Bauer (Berlin)
Desmond Durkin-Meisterernst (Berlin)
Lutz Edzard (Oslo/Erlangen)
Jürgen Hanneder (Marburg)
Herrmann Jungraithmayr (Marburg)
Karénina Kollmar-Paulenz (Bern)
Jens Peter Laut (Göttingen)
Joachim Friedrich Quack (Heidelberg)
Florian C. Reiter (Berlin)
Michael Streck (Leipzig)

2017

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

Adaptive Reuse

Aspects of Creativity in South Asian Cultural History

Edited by
Elisa Freschi and Philipp A. Maas

2017

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

Published with the support of Austrian Science Fund (FWF): PUB 403-G24

Open access: Wo nicht anders festgehalten, ist diese Publikation lizensiert unter der Creative-commons-Lizenz Namensnennung 4.0.
Open access: Except where otherwise noted, this work is licensed under a Creative commons Atribution 4.0 Unported License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek
Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über http://dnb.dnb.de abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the internet at http://dnb.dnb.de.

For further information about our publishing program consult our website http://www.harrassowitz-verlag.de

© Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft 2017
Printed on permanent/durable paper.
Printing and binding: Hubert & Co., Göttingen
Printed in Germany

ISSN 0567-4980
ISBN 978-3-447-10707-5

Contents

Elisa Freschi and *Philipp A. Maas*
Introduction: Conceptual Reflections on Adaptive Reuse 11
1 The dialectics of originality and reuse 11
2 The background 12
3 Some basic conceptual tools 13
3.1 Simple re-use versus different grades of adaptive reuse 13
4 Adaptive reuse: Aspects of creativity 17
5 "Adaptive reuse" and related terms 20
5.1 Adaptive reuse, intertextuality and adaptation studies 20
6 On the present volume 21
References 24

Section 1: Adaptive Reuse of Indian Philosophy and Other Systems of Knowledge

Philipp A. Maas
From Theory to Poetry: The Reuse of Patañjali's Yogaśāstra in Māgha's *Śiśupālavadha* 29
1 The *Pātañjalayogaśāstra* 30
2 Māgha's *Śiśupālavadha* 31
3 The *Śiśupālavadha* and Sāṅkhya Yoga in academic research 34
4 Pātañjala Yoga in the *Śiśupālavadha* 36
4.1 The stanza *Śiśupālavadha* 4.55 36
4.1.1 The reuse of the *Pātañjalayogaśāstra* in *Śiśupālavadha* 4.55 37
4.1.2 *Śiśupālavadha* 4.55 in context 41
4.2 The stanza *Śiśupālavadha* 14.62 46
4.2.1 The reuse of the *Pātañjalayogaśāstra* in *Śiśupālavadha* 14.62 47
4.2.2 *Śiśupālavadha* 14.62 in context 49
4.3 The passage *Śiśupālavadha* 1.31–33 51
4.4 The reception of Māgha's reuse in Vallabhadeva's *Antidote* 53
5 Conclusions 55

References 57

Himal Trikha
Creativity within Limits: Different Usages of a Single Argument from Dharmakīrti's *Vādanyāya* in Vidyānandin's Works 63
1 A passage from the *Vādanyāya* and an overview of corresponding textual material 65
1.1 The background of the argument 66
1.2 Overview of corresponding passages 68
1.3 Groups of correlating elements 71
2 The succession of transmission for the adaptions in Vācaspati's and Aśoka's works 73
2.1 Basic types of the succession of transmission 73
2.2 The adaption in the *Nyāyavārttikatātparyaṭīkā* 75
2.3 The adaption in the *Sāmānyadūṣaṇa* 79
3 Vidyānandin's use of the argument 82
3.1 The adaptions in the *Tattvārthaślokavārttikālaṅkāra* 82
3.2 The adaptions in the *Aṣṭasahasrī* 87
3.3 The adaptions in the *Satyaśāsanaparīkṣā* 95
4 Conclusion 101
References 102

Ivan Andrijanić
Traces of Reuse in Śaṅkara's Commentary on the *Brahmasūtra* 109
1 Introduction 109
2 Material marked by Śaṅkara or by sub-commentators as being reused from other authors 113
2.1 Indefinite pronouns as markers of reuse 113
2.2 Identifications of reuse by the sub-commentators 115
2.2.1 Reuse of the views of the Vṛttikāra 116
3 Different interpretations of the same *sūtra*s 118
4 Examples of reuse 119
4.1 The case of *ānandamaya* in *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* 1.1.12–1.1.19 119
4.1.1 The introduction of the *adhikaraṇa* 120
4.1.2 *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* 1.1.12 121
4.1.3 *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* 1.1.13–17 121
4.1.4 *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* 1.1.17 122
4.1.5 *Brahmasūtrabhāṣya* 1.1.19 123
4.2 The "bridge" (*setu*) from BS(Bh) 1.3.1 and MU(Bh) 2.2.5 126

5 Conclusions and outlook for further research.....129
References.....130

Yasutaka Muroya
On Parallel Passages in the Nyāya Commentaries of Vācaspati Miśra and Bhaṭṭa Vāgīśvara 135
1 Bhaṭṭa Vāgīśvara's *Nyāyasūtratātparyadīpikā*.....136
2 Parallel passages in the *Nyāyasūtratātparyadīpikā*, the *Nyāyabhāṣya* and the *Nyāyavārttika* 138
3 Parallel passages in the *Nyāyasūtratātparyadīpikā* and the *Nyāyavārttikatātpāryaṭīkā*.....138
3.1 Vāgīśvara and Vācaspati on *Nyāyasūtra* 1.1.1 139
3.1.1 Udayana's theory of categories.....142
3.2 Vāgīśvara and Vācaspati on *Nyāyasūtra* *5.2.15(16).....143
3.2.1 Dharmakīrti's discussion of *ananubhāṣaṇa*.....145
3.2.2 Vāgīśvara's and Vācaspati's references to Dharmakīrti 147
4 On the relative chronology of Vāgīśvara and Vācaspati 148
References.....150

Malhar Kulkarni
Adaptive Reuse of the Descriptive Technique of Pāṇini in Non-Pāṇinian Grammatical Traditions with Special Reference to the Derivation of the Declension of the 1st and 2nd Person Pronouns 155
References.....166

Section 2: Adaptive Reuse of Tropes

Elena Mucciarelli
The Steadiness of a Non-steady Place: Re-adaptations of the Imagery of the Chariot.....169
Premise 169
1 The Ṛgvedic *ratha*: The chariot as a living prismatic metaphor 171
1.1 *ratha* and swiftness 171
1.1.1 *ratha* as a means for crossing fields.....173
1.2 The godly character of the *ratha*.....173
1.3 *ratha* and conquest.....174
1.4 *ratha* in the ritual context.....174
1.5 *ratha* and poetry.....175
1.6 *ratha* and generative power 176
1.7 Summing up: The many semantic values of the *ratha* in the *Ṛgveda Saṃhitā*.....178

1.8 The medieval adaptive reuse of the *ratha* compared to its Vedic use 178
2 The linear re-use of the *ratha* in the middle Vedic period: The symbolic chariot 179
2.1 The socio-political context of the re-use 179
2.2 The chariot in the middle Vedic sacrifices 180
2.2.1 The chariot in non-royal sacrifices 181
2.2.2 The chariot in the royal sacrifices 182
2.2.3 The chariot and the evocation of fertility 187
2.3 Shrinking of meanings in middle Vedic reuse 188
3 Conclusion 188
References 189

Cristina Bignami
Chariot Festivals: The Reuse of the Chariot as Space in Movement 195
1 Introduction 195
2 The origins of chariot processions in the Vedic period 197
3 Faxian's record of chariot festivals 198
4 A record of the chariot festival in the southern kingdom 200
5 The modern ritual of *rathotsava* at the Cennakeśava Temple of Belur, Karnataka 202
6 The modern ritual of *rathayātrā* at Puri, Orissa 204
7 Applying the concept of reuse: The chariot in the diaspora 205
8 Conclusions 209
Figures 210
References 212

Section 3: Adaptive Reuse of Untraced and Virtual Texts

Daniele Cuneo
"This is Not a Quote": Quotation Emplotment, Quotational Hoaxes and Other Unusual Cases of Textual Reuse in Sanskrit Poetics-cum-Dramaturgy 219
1 Introduction: Reuse, novelty, and tradition 220
2 *Śāstra* as an ideological apparatus 221
3 The worldly *śāstra*, its fuzzy boundaries, and the derivation of *rasa*s 224
4 Quotation emplotment and the teleology of commentarial thought 232
5 Quotational hoaxes and novelty under siege 236
6 Unabashed repetition and authorial sleight of hand 237
7 Conclusions: The alternate fortunes of the two paradigms of textual authoritativeness 239

Appendix: Four translations of Abhinavagupta's intermezzo 246
References 247

Kiyokazu Okita
Quotation, Quarrel and Controversy in Early Modern South Asia:
Appayya Dīkṣita and Jīva Gosvāmī on Madhva's Untraceable Citations ... 255
Introduction 255
1 The modern controversy: Mesquita vs. Sharma 256
2 Untraceable quotes and Purāṇic studies 257
3 Untraceable quotes and Vedānta as Hindu theology 259
4 Early modern controversy: Appayya Dīkṣita vs. Jīva Gosvāmī 260
4.1 Appayya Dīkṣita 260
4.2 Jīva Gosvāmī 267
Conclusion 274
References 275

Elisa Freschi
Reusing, Adapting, Distorting? Veṅkaṭanātha's Reuse of Rāmānuja,
Yāmuna (and the Vṛttikāra) in his Commentary ad
Pūrvamīmāṃsāsūtra 1.1.1 281
1 Early Vaiṣṇava synthesizing philosophies 281
2 Veṅkaṭanātha as a continuator of Rāmānuja (and of Yāmuna) 283
3 The *Śrībhāṣya* and the *Seśvaramīmāṃsā*: Shared textual material .. 285
3.1 Examples 285
3.1.1 The beginning of the commentary 285
3.1.2 Commentary on *jijñāsā* 287
3.1.3 *vyatireka* cases 288
3.1.3.1 Śaṅkara's commentary on the same *sūtra* 288
3.1.3.2 Bhāskara's commentary on the same *sūtra* 290
3.2 Conclusions on the commentaries ad *Brahmasūtra* / *Pūrvamīmāṃsāsūtra* 1.1.1 293
4 The *Śrībhāṣya* and the *Seśvaramīmāṃsā*: A shared agenda concerning *aikaśāstrya* 294
4.1 Similarities between the treatment of *aikaśāstrya* in the *Seśvaramīmāṃsā* and the *Śrībhāṣya* 295
4.2 The *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* 297
4.2.1 The extant *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* 299
4.2.2 The *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa-devatākāṇḍa* 303
4.2.3 Quotations from the *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* 304
4.2.4 The *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* and Advaita Vedānta 306
4.2.5 The *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* and the Pāñcarātra 309

4.2.6 Conclusions on the *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* 310
4.2.7 The authorship of the *Saṅkarṣakāṇḍa* 312
5 Yāmuna and the *Seśvaramīmāṃsā*: Shared textual material 316
6 Conclusions 319
References 320

Cezary Galewicz
If You Don't Know the Source, Call it a *yāmala*:
Quotations and Ghost Titles in the *Ṛgvedakalpadruma* 327
1 The *Ṛgvedakalpadruma* 329
2 The concept of the *daśagrantha* 330
2.1 Keśava Māṭe's interpretation of the *daśagrantha* 331
2.2 The *sūtra* within Keśava's *daśagrantha* 332
3 The *Rudrayāmala* as quoted in the *Ṛgvedakalpadruma* 336
4 The *Rudrayāmala* and the *yāmala*s 338
5 Textual identity reconsidered 340
6 What does the name *Rudrayāmala* stand for? 341
7 Tantricized Veda or Vedicized Tantra? 342
8 Quotations and loci of ascription 343
9 Spatial topography of ideas 345
References 346

Section 4: Reuse from the Perspective of the Digital Humanities

Sven Sellmer
Methodological and Practical Remarks on the Question of Reuse in
Epic Texts 355
Introduction 355
1 Epic reuse 357
1.1 Internal reuse 358
1.1.1 Repetitions 358
1.1.2 Fixed formulas 359
1.1.3 Formulaic expressions 360
1.1.4 Flexible patterns 360
1.2 External reuse and its detection 361
1.2.1 Unusual vocabulary 363
1.2.2 Exceptional heterotopes 365
1.2.3 Specific metrical patterns 368
Conclusion 369
References 370